Chapter Six: Historic Preservation

I. Existing Conditions

II. Preservation Efforts and Designations

III. Objectives and Strategies

I. Existing Conditions

Historic preserving our historic resources provides important insight into the lives of earlier generations and helps us understand the character of Dublin today. Local archeological resources also date back to prehistoric times, providing clues about the migration and settlement of early civilizations in the Columbus area. Historic structures still standing in Dublin present evidence of daily life, as well as preserve information about construction techniques and architectural styles spanning several periods of history – the oldest dating back to the early 1820s. Unlike many natural resources which may be restored over time, once lost, historic resources cannot be resurrected. While local, state and federal laws offer some degree of protection for these resources, the local community must ultimately stand behind historic preservation efforts. This chapter identifies ways to ensure that Dublin’s historic resources will be preserved for the enrichment of future generations.

A. Archeological Resources

The Ohio Historic Preservation Office maintains an inventory of the state’s archeological resources. Map 6.1 illustrates the general location of some of the more significant sites discussed in this section, as identified by corresponding letters in Appendix II.

Since the late 19th century, archeological excavations in the Dublin area have uncovered several significant finds. Prehistoric archeological materials recovered through excavation indicate the Dublin area was occupied by the Palaeo-Indian culture as far back as 11,000 years. The Palaeo-Indians, a highly mobile hunting society, were the first known prehistoric group to occupy the Ohio area and were a highly mobile hunting society. Two campsites attributed to a Palaeo or Archaic culture were excavated in the late 1970s near the Scioto River within Dublin (Site C) generally at the present day Amberleigh subdivision. Another possible site of Palaeo occupation has been excavated along the North Fork Indian Run, north of I-270 near present day Dublin Coffman High School and the Cardinal Health Headquarters (Site I).

Other prehistoric materials recovered indicate that the area was occupied during the Early Archaic (9000 to 6000 B.C.), Middle Archaic (6000 B.C. to 3000 B.C.) and Late Archaic (3000 B.C. to 900 B.C.) periods. Like the Palaeo-Indians, Early Archaic inhabitants of the area were highly mobile. However, these people began to develop more established settlements as they started to rely on seasonal hunting and some seasonal plant foods. The Middle Archaic period saw a continued trend toward more permanent settlements as a broader range of food sources became available. The Late Archaic period saw continued
Numerous excavations throughout the Dublin area have uncovered materials from these three Archaic periods, and several of these sites are noteworthy. Evidence of a possible Late Archaic quarry site and chipping station has been found along the North Fork Indian Run (Site I). Several excavations in the Brand Road area, east of Muirfield Drive near the Dublin Municipal Pool North, have uncovered several projectile points and tool fragments dating to the Middle or Late Archaic periods (Site H). Evidence of several campsites along the Scioto River dating to the Late Archaic period was discovered in the late 1970s (Site C), and several excavations in the Sawmill Road area north of I-270 have uncovered various materials dating to the Archaic periods (Sites A, B, D and E).

Evidence of settlement during the Middle and Late Woodland periods (100 B.C. to A.D. 500) is also present within the study area. These periods are illustrated most notably in Ohio by the Hopewell culture. The Hopewell civilization grew out of the Adena culture, which dominated the Early Woodland (900 B.C. to 100 B.C.) period.

The Hopewell people were highly ceremonial and developed expansive trade networks to acquire the raw materials for many of their ceremonial objects. The majority of archaeological discoveries relating to the Hopewell culture are ceremonial earthworks and mounds. There is little evidence of their settlements or means of subsistence. It is assumed that they relied primarily on hunting with limited cultivation of plants such as corn for nutrition. The Hopewell culture declined during the Late Woodland period, but the exact cause of that decline is unknown.

Excavations along the Scioto River indicate the area was well occupied during the Woodland periods. The most significant evidence of the Hopewell culture locally is the site known as the Holder-Wright Group Works Mounds (Site G) near the northeast corner of Bright Road and Riverside Drive. This site contains earthwork circles and burial mounds that date back to between 300 B.C. and A.D. 500.

The earthwork circles and mounds were ceremonial grounds used, in part, as burial sites. The Holder-Wright site was initially excavated in 1887 and has been studied on several occasions. Though the integrity of the site has been damaged by cultivation and grading in the area, the archaeological significance remains largely intact. The Holder-Wright Group Works Mounds are listed on the National Register of Historic Places. In 2010, the City of Dublin purchased 21 acres of land south of Bright Road, including portions of this site. The City has also prepared a master plan for preservation of the entire 47-acre Holder-Wright farmstead and earthworks.

The Krumm Mound (Site G), of which less is known, lies in close proximity to the Holder-Wright site. The mound appears to date from the Hopewell period, but is unrelated to the Holder-Wright Works. Possibly related to the Krumm Mound is the McGuuerer Cemetery (Site J), excavated in 1921 after a portion of the site had been used as a gravel pit. While the integrity of the find was severely compromised...
by this activity, skeletal remains of at least 31 individuals were found within one burial pit. Included in this were, one of which was the intact skeletal remains of one prehistoric person.

Archaeological excavations in late 1994 and early 1995, in numerous areas near State Route 161 (Site K), have yielded prehistoric materials with potentially great historic significance. At least one site was found to be eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, and more may become eligible. The quantity and quality of prehistoric materials recovered have identified a quarry and work settlement dating to the Late Archaic and Middle Woodland periods. More excavation work will be necessary to help fully understand the archaeological significance of the material in this area.

Following habitation by the Adena and Hopewell, later tribes such as the Delaware, Mingo, Seneca, Shawnee and Wyandotte moved into the area, and numerous archaeological excavations have revealed cultural artifacts of a more recent historical nature. Related to this migration, European-Americans began to settle in the area during the early 19th century, and eventually resulting in the establishment of the Village of Dublin in 1810. Several excavations in 1993, in the area of I-270 between Tuttle Crossing Boulevard and Hayden Run Road, uncovered historical remnants of European-American origin, dating circa 1850 (Site M). Included in this were kitchen and architectural artifacts and the remnants of a farmstead (possibly the Turner farmstead) excavated in 1994. No recent excavations in the Dublin area have yielded historic artifacts of notable significance.

**B. Historic Structures**

Much of a community's character is derived from its historic architecture and built heritage. Many of Dublin's historic buildings, along with several unique dry-laid stone walls and cemetery vaults, warrant some degree of protection. Map 6.1 illustrates the general location of these historic structures, as identified by corresponding numbers on Table 6.1. Map 6.2 on page 253 provides a detail of Historic Dublin and its many historic sites.

The oldest surviving structure is a log cabin built in 1803 by Ludwig Sells (Site 776028 Dublin Road). The cabin stands on the property of the historic William Sells House, a home constructed in 1840 of large cut stone. Several of Dublin's historic homes and many of the stone walls are attributed to the Sells family (Sites 1, 75, 77, and 89). Sells' family, including walls in Historic Dublin and on properties at 6729 Dublin Road, 6028 Dublin Road and 4586 Hayden Run Road.

Most of Dublin's historic structures are concentrated in Historic Dublin, the City's original settlement. Approximately 20 structures, mostly residences and small commercial buildings of the original settlement, are contained in the 6 to 126 South High Street Historic District. A variety of architectural styles are represented on High Street, from simple vernacular stone houses to more elaborate Federal-style, Italianate and Greek Revival buildings that served as the homes and businesses of some of Dublin's more prominent founders.

Several of Historic Dublin's original homes have since been converted to retail shops and restaurants. Zenas Hutchinson, Dublin's first mayor, operated the Hutchinson Tavern at 6 South High Street, a two-
story stone, Federal-style stick-built structure dating to 1832. The use of this structure has not changed significantly over the years; today it operates as a small retail store and restaurant. Similarly, the two-story, Federal-style stick-built structure at 76 to 78 South High Street was once a hotel, originally built in 1830 by Holcomb Tuller. It also houses a restaurant and commercial uses. Most restorations have demonstrated sensitivity to their historic value and an appreciation for original details.

In addition to Historic Dublin, several historic farmsteads, former general stores and churches are located throughout the City and the wider planning area. Most of these properties date back to the middle of the 19th century and are located along original early roads such as Hayden Run Road, Rings Road and Brand Roads.

Many properties shown on Map 6.2 are within the Washington Township Multiple Resource Area (WTMRA), a National Register of Historic Places designation that groups historic structures by a common theme. In this case, the Resource Area is the original settlement of Washington Township (Historic Dublin). Table 6.1 identifies historic properties in the Dublin area and the numbers correspond to the historic resources on Map 6.1. A complete list of these properties and their significance can be found in Appendix III.

II. Preservation Efforts AND Designations

Questions often arise for property owners as to whether properties have any specific historic designations or protections. Depending upon the federal, state, or local level, a variety of different historic designations are available that have different meanings and levels, each of which has its own meaning and level of protection.

National Register of Historic Places (NRHP)

The National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) is the official list of historic properties recognized by the National Park Service, through the U.S. Department of the Interior, as worthy of preservation for their local, state or national significance; it is the highest degree of recognition of historic resources. Nomination to the National Register does not guarantee the preservation of an historic structure and does not prevent the owner from remodeling, repairing, altering, selling or even demolishing the historic property as long as federal money is not used for this purpose. Listing on the National Register provides protection from demolition or other negative effects when federally funded or licensed projects are involved. The primary benefit to the property owner is the honor of being recognized as a steward of historic resources, the prestige of being listed on the National Register, and the potential to receive tax benefits and to apply for certain historic preservation grants.

Districts, sites, buildings, structures and objects with significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering or culture may qualify for listing on the National Register. They must possess integrity in their location, design, setting, materials, craftsmanship, visual feel and association. In addition, they must satisfy one of the following criteria:
1. They are associated with historically significant events;

2. They are associated with the lives of significant persons;

3. They embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or are associated with the work of a master, possess high artistic value or represent a significant and distinguishable entity; or

4. They have, or may yield information important to prehistory or history.

Listing on the National Register highlights the historic significance of structures and may result in public pressure upon owners to maintain the structures. In Ohio, anyone may nominate a property to the National Register. A completed application must be reviewed at the local level and approved by a review board appointed by the Governor. The state review board makes a recommendation and forwards it to the National Park Service for a final determination.

**Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) and Ohio Archeological Inventory (OAI)**

The Ohio Historic Inventory and the Ohio Archeological Inventory are programs developed to provide an ongoing record of historic architecture, properties and archaeological sites within the state. The inventories provide an historic archive and a general body of information for the Ohio Historic Preservation Office (OHPO), other state, local and federal agencies and the general public to utilize in making planning and infrastructure decisions. More importantly, the inventories provide a reference for local preservation efforts to safeguard important historic resources. However, like the National Register, an OHI or OAI record does not itself provide a guarantee of preservation of a historic structure or site.

**Local Preservation Efforts**

In an effort to protect valuable historic resources, individual communities have a higher level of power to protect their architectural and archeological heritage, usually through local zoning or other regulatory measures. Through the guidance of the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, individual communities may become certified to carry out preservation programs that meet basic state and federal criteria. The Certified Local Government (CLG) program is a federal-state-local partnership that allows Dublin to conduct a wide range of preservation activities and provides eligibility for state or federal preservation grants. Certified by the OHPO in September 1994, the City of Dublin monitors and protects historic properties under Section 153.170 of Dublin’s Codified Ordinances (Zoning Code) as part of the Architectural Review District. The District includes Historic Dublin and other historically significant properties and sites located throughout the City, as specified in the Zoning Code. Unlike the National Register of Historic Places, the Ohio Historic Inventory or the Ohio Archeological Inventory, Dublin’s local ordinances and development regulations provide the direct ability to protect historic buildings, structures and sites.

As part of the local CLG requirements, the Dublin Architectural Review Board (ARB) has been appointed by City Council to ensure the protection of Dublin’s historic resources. The ARB is responsible
for regulating the appropriateness of exterior architectural and site modifications and demolitions for sites and structures within the Architectural Review District, including the specified outlying historic properties. The ARB is also responsible for making recommendations on land use changes and preservation-related legislation to City Council. The Architectural Review Board ARB is further charged with maintaining an inventory of all landmarks and preservation districts in the City of Dublin, as well as developing and administering guidelines that define the historic appropriateness of alterations, demolitions, environmental changes and new construction for designated structures and sites.

Property owners within the Architectural Review District must submit an application for Architectural Review Board review and approval that demonstrates appropriateness prior to making any exterior architectural or site modifications. Among other measures, the City has created the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines have been specifically created by the City to explain the important character and nature of Dublin’s historic resources and to assist property owners in making appropriate architectural and site modifications.

All owners of properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places, the Ohio Historic Inventory, and the Ohio Archeological Inventory are strongly encouraged to utilize federal, state and local design guidelines when modifying historic structures and properties. Local protection from inappropriate alterations or demolition is possible for those properties designated in Dublin’s Codified Ordinances as part of the Architectural Review District, making the periodic update of the Zoning Code an important aspect to the protection of historic properties in a rapidly growing municipality. Property owners within the Architectural Review District must submit an application for Architectural Review Board review and approval that demonstrates appropriateness prior to making any exterior architectural or site modifications.

Substantial redevelopment and revitalization will continue to occur in Historic Dublin, and pressure from development is Beginning to encroach outlying historic farmsteads. Local Of particular note, the Bridge Street District planning initiative has included a considerable effort to preserve the integrity of Historic Dublin and to build upon its success as a walkable, mixed use destination. Zoning regulations adopted in 2012 include special districts for the historic residential neighborhoods along South Riverview and South High Streets, as well as the historic commercial core along High and Bridge Streets. Special building types and other development requirements are designed to encourage appropriate infill development that respects the scale and character of the Historic District that can easily transition to adjacent denser, more modern urban neighborhoods. Innovative development strategies such as these, coupled with other local preservation efforts, ensure that the quality of Historic Dublin and the rich historic character of the Dublin area can be maintained and enhanced for future generations.

III. Objectives and Strategies (Historic Preservation)

Objective 1: Ensure the preservation of archeological resources.
Dublin’s current development regulations do not require developers to submit information on known archeological resources when applying for development approval. While sites and artifacts that have been discovered are catalogued by the Ohio Historic Preservation Office as part of the Ohio Archeological Inventory, no local process has been established to address the potential discovery of archeological sites/artifacts during construction. Potential locations (including unmarked cemeteries) may be known, but have not been adequately studied or noted. Additionally, farming techniques and development pose a threat to fragile artifacts and potential sites.

A. **Modify Zoning Regulations**... and current development processes to require developers to locate and properly record archeological resources when submitting plans for approval.

B. **Establish Clear Guidelines**... for the reporting and public oversight of new archeological resources. City officials are often unaware of the potential presence of artifacts or archeological sites, and clear processes for developers and staff are necessary once issues are identified.

C. **Encourage Appropriate Site Development Practices**... that are sensitive to known areas of significant archeological materials.

D. **Utilize Historian/Archivist Assistance**... to record and preserve artifacts exposed during the construction process. The City should hire consultants or assume responsibility to ensure that archeological materials are addressed properly during development to prevent permanent damage to the quality of discovered artifacts.

E. **Update the Ohio Archeological Inventory**... on an ongoing basis and report changes to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office. Also encourage updates to the Community Plan to ensure that developers and staff are aware of newly recorded sites.

F. **Encourage Additional Development Tools**... such as conservation easements, parkland dedication or other policies and regulations to protect known archeological sites.

G. **Acquire Properties or Options**... for known sites as a way to preserve and maintain the quality of significant archeological locations.

H. **Consider Additional Study**... of significant archeological sites that could warrant nomination to the National Register of Historic Places.

**Objective 2: Regularly update the Ohio Historic Inventory.**

Dublin is a young, but aging community, and structures previously not listed in the Ohio Historic Inventory may become eligible if minimum criteria are met. Structures generally more than 50 years old, those with historic significance (association with important persons or events), or buildings that represent a certain historic period are examples of how history is constantly in the process of being made. Historic properties listed on the Ohio Historic Inventory but not protected by local architectural review are constantly being altered and/or demolished. It is the responsibility of the City and the Dublin
Architectural Review Board as a Certified Local Government to ensure that up-to-date records are kept and made available to the public.

A. **Conduct Periodic Inventory Updates**… to the Ohio Historic Inventory to identify newly qualifying structures, alterations to existing buildings or demolitions of recorded structures.

B. **Establish Clear Policy Direction**… for how newly qualifying structures should be addressed. In particular, clear guidelines should be created for postwar ranches and other period structures that may now be eligible.

C. **Ensure Ongoing Submissions**… of new property recommendations to the Architectural Review Board (and ultimately City Council) for inclusion as part of the Architectural Review District. Modify the Dublin Zoning Code to reflect those structures that warrant protection under the City’s preservation ordinance to guarantee that the properties are protected.

Objective 3: Protect historic resources in outlying areas in and beyond Dublin’s corporate boundaries.

Historic resources outside the City of Dublin are not offered the same degree of oversight or protection as structures within Dublin’s corporate boundaries. Current provisions of the Ohio Revised Code do not provide townships with the legal abilities or rights to regulate historic resources in the same way as municipalities. As development continues westward into outlying areas, historic farmsteads are being razed to make way for development. The Historic Dublin Design Guidelines also do not address rural resources and outlying farmsteads, and the Dublin Zoning Code does not adequately protect outlying farmsteads within the City.

A. **Evaluate Annexation and Development Processes**… to determine how historic resources can be better evaluated and saved. Consider incentives as part of the zoning/development process for property owners who protect historic structures prior to annexation to meet Dublin’s objectives of preserving valuable historic structures.

B. **Work with Counties and Townships**… to develop joint policies that will better address the preservation of historic structures and farmsteads that are important components of rural character and architectural history.

C. **Use Lobbying Efforts**… to promote changes to the Ohio Revised Code that will grant townships the ability to provide preservation oversight comparable to municipal programs administered by the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

D. **Revise Historic District Guidelines**… to provide better guidance for the preservation of historic farmsteads and for integrating historic farmsteads into new development.

E. **Amend the Zoning Code**… to protect more outlying farmsteads and agricultural outbuildings from demolition.
Objective 4: Ensure the preservation of historic architectural resources and the general improvement and maintenance of structures within Historic Dublin and outlying historic sites in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines.

Many valued structures are in disrepair and may eventually have to be removed due to safety concerns. Insufficient property maintenance and upkeep within the District may jeopardize the value and integrity of Historic Dublin. The District has also been hampered by suburban zoning standards that restrict historically compatible development. The need for multiple variances to accomplish simple projects makes approval processes uncertain, confusing and time-consuming.

A. **Emphasize Enforcement Measures**… of the Zoning Code and Building Code within Historic Dublin on a regular basis, particularly with National Register properties, to prevent deterioration of structures from neglect.

B. **Encourage Better Self-Policing**… of properties by tenants and owners within Historic Dublin. Better self-identity and pride in the District’s appearance is needed to show a desire for positive change.

C. **Encourage Direct Ownership and Operation**… of commercial properties so that there are greater personal consequences in the daily appearance and image of properties within the District.

D. **Promote Greater Tenant Involvement**… in the upkeep and appearance of building facades, parking areas and public space around businesses to create a better image and sense of ownership for the District.

E. **Explore Federal and State Grants**… and other assistance for property owners to create a better balance between preservation and the feasible utilization of structures.

F. **Create Local Assistance Programs**… to provide help to individuals to facilitate the upgrade of exterior building materials compatible with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and local guidelines. Providing additional assistance for seniors on fixed income to upgrade hail-damaged siding from vinyl to a recommended material is one example where limited assistance can make significant visual improvements to the District.

G. **Encourage Adaptive Reuse Policies**… and economic incentives/assistance that such as historic preservation grants, which will encourage the continued use of historic structures to and prevent deterioration.

H. **Utilize Preservation / Architectural Consultants**… to regularly provide additional review/oversight on proposed architectural modifications to maintain the historic integrity of significant structures.

I. **Revise Code Requirements**… to create new, specific Monitor the BSC Historic Zoning District Regulations … to ensure the new requirements administered by the Architectural Review Board successfully result in development and redevelopment that will reduce the number of regulatory steps and ensure a predictable review process.
I. Complete a City-Sponsored Rezoning... for properties within is compatible with the District to the Historic Residential (HR) and Historic Business (HB) Districts to reduce required variances surrounding historic context.

K. Utilize J. Use Evaluative Tools... such as the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines, 2007 Dublin Community the Bridge Street District Area Plan and other applicable plans for future development direction in Historic Dublin.

L. Adopt and Implement Revitalization Plans... for the Historic Dublin area to assist decision-makers in balancing District preservation with future growth and development and to provide consistent direction for property owners, potential developers and elected officials.

Objective 5: Strive to improve general public awareness of cultural and historic resources and public entities working to maintain the District.

The general public, business owners and owners of historic properties frequently do not understand preservation issues or how to obtain helpful information relevant to historic properties and maintenance. Improved distribution of information and communication with the District can enhance cooperative efforts and reduce negative perceptions about the District, Architectural Review Board and the City, facilitating increased preservation efforts.

A. Promote Educational Campaigns... and programs to increase the knowledge of Dublin’s historic resources and utilize key public resources and organizations such as libraries, schools and civic groups as facilitators of information.

B. Improve Awareness Continue Communication Campaigns..., such as quarterly newsletters, to increase knowledge of the development process, the Architectural Review Board... and its role in the development process through community relations techniques as a means to reduce misinformation and negative perceptions of the Board and planning/enforcement efforts.

C. Increase Special Events... in the District as a means to attract people and provide greater visibility for Historic Dublin and its businesses.

D. Create a Visible Location... for the Dublin Historical Society within the District to make history and preservation a more visible topic easily accessible to residents and visitors within the District.

E. Encourage Public and Private Art... within Historic Dublin as a means to provide historic information and to create ties to the past that will improve the public value of preservation efforts.

Objective 6: Emphasize the Dublin Historical Society as a vital historic resource and encourage the recording of historic information for public use.

Written history of individual historic properties and structures within the Historic District is often incomplete and makes the administration of architectural preservation programs very difficult. Significant
historic information regarding the settlement and growth of Dublin is known but not clearly recorded on a site-by-site basis. Turnover in membership of the Dublin Historical Society may result in a significant loss of valuable information if not properly recorded.

A. *Conduct Personal Interviews*… with members of the Dublin Historical Society and owners of historic properties to obtain greater information about particular structures or sites listed on the National Register and to facilitate improved decisions about architectural and site modifications within Historic Dublin.

B. *Create Strategic Plans*… to maintain the future viability and sustainability of the Society as an active and functioning public organization. Its role in the community and overall visibility should be increased.

C. *Establish a Preservation Record*… for individual properties/buildings through the utilization of volunteer work or a master’s thesis project.

D. *Provide Municipal Support*… for the Dublin Historical Society as an important public institution through financial and promotional support or other available means.

E. *Encourage a More Active Society*… that can promote enhanced communication, membership drives and public service as a means to increase the organization’s value to the City and its residents.

F. *Increase Organization Visibility*… by providing a more prominent location in Historic Dublin by which the Historical Society can interact and share information with the general public.

Objective 7: Provide additional effort to preserve and maintain important cultural/historic landscape elements, including cemeteries, within Historic Dublin and throughout the City.

While the Architectural Review District places emphasis on historic buildings or structures, there are many important natural features and landscapes that have significant community value. Often, the historic value of a structure must also be considered in the context within which it is situated, and these landscapes are important to maintaining proper scale and character in historically significant areas.

A. *Improve Dublin Spring Park*… and the historic Scioto River bridge as an important architectural feature, public access area and river crossing point.

B. *Maintain the Karrer Barn*… site and its visual integrity as a passive public open space.

C. *Protect the Character/Integrity of Cemeteries*… in Historic Dublin and throughout the City as important historic and emotional ties to Dublin’s past.

D. *Identify and Protect Cultural Landscapes*… of value throughout the City that are not included within architectural or archaeological inventories.