

Chapter Six: HISTORIC PRESERVATION

I. Existing Conditions

II. Preservation Efforts and Designations

III. Objectives and Strategies

~~I.~~ EXISTING CONDITIONS

Preserving our hHistoric resources provides important insight into the lives of earlier generations and helps us understand the character of Dublin today. ~~Local~~ Other archeological resources ~~also~~ date back to prehistoric times, providing clues about the migration and settlement of early civilizations in the Columbus area. Historic structures still existing-standing in Dublin present evidence of daily life, as well as preserve information about construction techniques and architectural styles spanning several periods of history – the oldest dating back to the early 1820s. Unlike many natural resources which may be restored over time, once lost, historic resources cannot be resurrected ~~once lost~~. While local, state and federal laws offer some degree of protection ~~for these resources~~, the local community must ultimately stand behind commit to historic preservation efforts. This chapter identifies ways to ensure that Dublin’s historic resources will be preserved for the enrichment of future generations.

~~A.~~ Archeological Resources

The Ohio Historic Preservation Office maintains an inventory of the state’s archaeological resources. ~~Map 6.1 illustrates the general location of some of the more significant sites discussed in this section, as identified by corresponding letters in Appendix H.~~

Since the late 19th century, archeological excavations in the Dublin area have uncovered several significant finds. Prehistoric archaeological materials recovered through excavation indicate the Dublin area was occupied by the Palaeo-Indian culture as far back as 11,000 B.C.-b.e. The Palaeo-Indians, a highly mobile hunting society, were the first known prehistoric group to occupy the Ohio area ~~and were a highly mobile hunting society~~. Two campsites attributed to a Palaeo or Archaic culture were excavated in the late 1970s near the Scioto River within Dublin (Site C) generally at the present day Amberleigh subdivision. Another possible site of Palaeo occupation has been excavated along the North Fork Indian Run, north of I-270 near present day Dublin Coffman High School and the Cardinal Health Headquarters (Site I).

Other prehistoric materials recovered indicate that the area was occupied during the Early Archaic (9000 ~~B.C.B.C.~~ to 6000 B.C.), Middle Archaic (6000 B.C. to 3000 B.C.) and Late Archaic (3000 B.C. to 900 B.C.) periods. Like the Palaeo-Indians, Early Archaic inhabitants of the area were highly mobile. However, these people began to develop more established settlements as they started to rely on seasonal hunting and some seasonal plant foods. The Middle Archaic period saw a continued trend toward more permanent settlements as a broader range of food sources became available. The Late Archaic period saw continued development of permanent settlements, including an increase in regional ceremonial cultures, as evidenced by formalized burial practices.

Numerous excavations throughout the Dublin area have uncovered materials from these three Archaic periods, and several of these sites are noteworthy. Evidence of a possible Late Archaic quarry site and chipping station has been found along the North Fork Indian Run (Site I). Several excavations in the Brand Road area, east of Muirfield Drive near the Dublin Municipal Pool North, have uncovered several projectile points and tool fragments dating to the Middle or Late Archaic periods (Site H). Evidence of several campsites along the Scioto River dating to the Late Archaic period was discovered in the late 1970s (Site C), and several excavations in the Sawmill Road area north of I-270 have uncovered various materials dating to the Archaic periods (Sites A, B, D and E).

Evidence of settlement during the Middle and Late Woodland periods (100 B.C. to A.D. 500) is also present within the study area. These periods are illustrated most notably in Ohio by the Hopewell culture. The Hopewell civilization grew out of the Adena culture, which dominated the Early Woodland (900 B.C. to 100 B.C.) period.

The Hopewell people were highly ceremonial and developed expansive trade networks to acquire the raw materials for many of their ceremonial objects. The majority of archaeological discoveries relating to the Hopewell culture are ceremonial earthworks and mounds. There is little evidence of their settlements or means of subsistence. It is assumed that they relied primarily on hunting with limited cultivation of plants such as corn for nutrition. The Hopewell culture declined during the Late Woodland period, ~~but the exact cause of that decline~~ is unknown.

Excavations along the Scioto River indicate the area was well occupied during the Woodland periods. The most significant evidence of the Hopewell culture locally is the site known as the Holder-Wright Group Works Mounds (Site G) near the northeast corner of Bright Road and Riverside Drive. This site contains earthwork circles and burial mounds that date back to between 300 B.C. and A.D. 500.

The earthwork circles and mounds were ceremonial grounds used, in part, as burial sites. The Holder-Wright site was initially excavated in 1887 and has been studied on several occasions. ~~Though the integrity of the site has been damaged~~ compromised by cultivation and grading in the area, the archaeological significance remains largely intact. The Holder-Wright Group Works Mounds are listed on the National Register of Historic Places. In 2010, the City of Dublin purchased 21 acres of land south of Bright Road, including portions of this site. The City has also prepared a master plan for preservation of the entire 47-acre Holder-Wright farmstead and earthworks.

The Krumm Mound (Site G), of which less is known, lies in close proximity to the Holder-Wright site. The mound appears to date from the Hopewell period, but is unrelated to the Holder-Wright Works. Possibly related to the Krumm Mound is the McGuerer Cemetery (Site J), excavated in 1921 after a portion of the site had been used as a gravel pit. While the integrity of the find was severely compromised by this activity, skeletal remains of at least 31 individuals were found within one burial pit, ~~one of which was. Included in this were~~ the intact skeletal remains of a one prehistoric person.

Archaeological excavations in late 1994 and early 1995, in numerous areas near State Route 161 (Site K), have yielded prehistoric materials with potentially great historic significance. ~~At least one site was found to be is~~ eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, and more may ~~become~~ eligible. ~~The quantity and quality of prehistoric materials recovered have identified a quarry and work settlement dating to the Late Archaic and Middle Woodland periods. More~~ Additional excavation work will help ~~be necessary to~~ fully understand the archaeological significance of the material in this area.

Following habitation by the Adena and Hopewell, later tribes such as the Delaware, Mingo, Seneca, Shawnee and Wyandotte moved into the area, and numerous archaeological excavations have revealed cultural artifacts related to this migration of a more recent historical nature. European-Americans began to settle in the area during the early 19th century, eventually resulting in the establishment of ~~and~~ the Village of Dublin ~~was established~~ in 1810. Several excavations in 1993, in the area of I-270 between Tuttle Crossing Boulevard and Hayden Run Road, uncovered historical remnants of European-American origin, dating circa 1850 (Site M). Included in this were kitchen and architectural artifacts and the remnants of a farmstead (possibly the Turner farmstead) excavated in 1994. ~~No recent excavations in the Dublin area have yielded historic artifacts of notable significance.~~

~~B.~~ Historic Structures

Much of a community's character is derived from its historic architecture and built heritage. Many of Dublin's historic buildings, along with several unique dry-laid stone walls and cemetery vaults, warrant some degree of protection. ~~Map 6.1 illustrates the general location of these historic structures, as identified by corresponding numbers on Table 6.1. Map 6.2 on page 253 provides a detail of Historic Dublin and its many historic sites.~~

The oldest surviving structure is a log cabin built in 1803 by Ludwig Sells (Site 77). The cabin stands on the property of the historic William Sells House, a home constructed in 1840 of large cut stone. Several of Dublin's historic homes and many of the stone walls are attributed to the Sells' family (Sites 1, 75, 77, and 89).

Most of Dublin's historic structures are concentrated in Historic Dublin, the ~~City's~~ city's original settlement. Approximately 20 structures, mostly residences and small commercial buildings of the original settlement, ~~are contained~~ lie in the 6 to 126 South High Street Historic District. A variety of architectural styles are represented on High Street, from simple vernacular stone houses to more elaborate Federal-style, Italianate and Greek Revival buildings that served as the homes and businesses of some of Dublin's more prominent founders.

Several of Historic Dublin's original homes have since been converted to retail shops and restaurants. Zenas Hutchinson, Dublin's first mayor, operated the Hutchinson Tavern at 6 South High Street, a two-story stone, Federal-style stick-built structure dating to 1832. The use of this structure has not changed significantly over the years; today it operates as a small retail store and restaurant. Similarly, the two-story, Federal-style stick-built structure at 76 to 78 South High Street was once a hotel, originally built in 1830 by Holcomb Tuller. It also houses a restaurant and commercial uses. ~~Most restorations have demonstrated sensitivity to their historic value and an appreciation for original details.~~

In addition to Historic Dublin, several historic farmsteads, former general stores and churches are located throughout the City and the wider planning area. Most of these properties date back to the middle of the 19th century and are located along original early roads such as Hayden Run Road, Rings Road and Brand Roads.

Many properties ~~shown on Map 6.2~~ are within the Washington Township Multiple Resource Area (WTMRA), a National Register of Historic Places designation that groups historic structures by a common theme. In this case, the Resource Area is the original settlement of Washington Township (Historic Dublin). ~~Table 6.1 identifies historic properties in the Dublin area and the numbers correspond to the historic resources on Map 6.1. A complete list of these properties and their significance can be found in Appendix III.~~

~~II.~~ PRESERVATION EFFORTS AND DESIGNATIONS

~~Questions often arise for~~ property owners ~~often question as to~~ whether properties have any specific historic designations or protections. Depending upon the federal, state, or local level, a variety of different historic designations are available ~~each of which has its~~ ~~that have different~~ ~~own~~ meanings and levels of protection.

National Register of Historic Places (NRHP)

The National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) is the official list of historic properties recognized by the National Park Service, through the U.S. Department of the Interior, as worthy of preservation for their local, state or national significance; ~~it is the highest degree of recognition of historic resources~~. Nomination to the National Register does not guarantee the preservation of an historic structure and does not prevent the owner from remodeling, repairing, altering, selling or even demolishing the historic property as long as federal money is not used for this purpose. Listing on the National Register provides protection from demolition or other negative effects when federally funded or licensed projects are involved. The primary benefit to the property owner is the honor of being recognized as a steward of historic resources, the prestige of being listed on the National Register, and the potential to receive tax benefits and ~~to~~ apply for certain historic preservation grants.

Districts, sites, buildings, structures and objects with significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering or culture may qualify for listing on the National Register. They must possess integrity in their location, design, setting, materials, craftsmanship, visual feel and association. In addition, they must satisfy one of the following criteria:

1. They are associated with historically significant events;
2. They are associated with the lives of significant persons;
3. They embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or are associated with the work of a master, possess high artistic value or represent a significant and distinguishable entity; or
4. They have, or may yield information important to prehistory or history.

Listing on the National Register highlights the historic significance of structures and may ~~stand as encouragement~~ ~~result in~~ ~~public pressure upon~~ ~~for~~ owners to maintain the structures. In Ohio, anyone may nominate a property to the National Register. A completed application must be reviewed at the local level and approved by a review board appointed by the Governor. The state review board makes a recommendation and forwards it to the National Park Service for a final determination.

Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) and Ohio Archeological Inventory (OAI)

The Ohio Historic Inventory and the Ohio Archeological Inventory are programs developed to provide an ongoing record of historic architecture, properties and archaeological sites within the state. The inventories provide an historic archive and a general body of information for the Ohio Historic Preservation Office (OHPO), other state, local and federal agencies and the general public to utilize in making planning and infrastructure decisions. More importantly, the inventories provide a reference for local preservation efforts to safeguard important historic resources. However, like the National Register, an OHI or OAI record does not itself provide a guarantee of the preservation of a historic structure or site.

Local Preservation Efforts

In an effort to protect valuable historic resources, individual communities have a higher level of power to protect their architectural and archeological heritage, usually through local zoning or other regulatory measures. Through the guidance of the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, individual communities may become certified to carry out preservation programs that meet basic state and federal criteria. The Certified Local Government (CLG) program is a federal-state-local partnership that allows Dublin to conduct a wide range of preservation activities and provides eligibility for state or federal preservation grants. Certified by the OHPO in September 1994, the City of Dublin monitors and protects historic properties under Section 153.170 of Dublin's Codified Ordinances (Zoning Code) as part of the Architectural Review District. The District includes Historic Dublin and other historically significant properties and sites located throughout the City, as specified in the Zoning Code. Unlike the National Register of Historic Places, the Ohio Historic Inventory or the Ohio Archeological Inventory, Dublin's local ordinances and development regulations provide the direct ability to protect historic buildings, structures and sites.

As part of the local CLG requirements, ~~the~~ Dublin's Architectural Review Board (ARB) has been appointed by City Council to ensure the protection of Dublin's historic resources. The ARB is responsible for regulating the appropriateness of exterior architectural and site modifications and demolitions for sites and structures within the Architectural Review District, including ~~the~~ specified outlying historic properties. The ARB is also responsible for making recommendations on land use changes and preservation-related legislation to City Council. The ~~Architectural Review Board~~ ARB is further charged with maintaining an inventory of all landmarks and preservation districts in the City of Dublin, as well as developing and administering guidelines that define the historic appropriateness of alterations, demolitions, environmental changes and new construction for designated structures and sites.

Property owners within the Architectural Review District must submit an application for Architectural Review Board review and approval that demonstrates appropriateness prior to making any exterior architectural or site modifications. ~~Among other measures, The~~ the City has created the *Historic Dublin Design Guidelines* ~~have been specifically created by the City~~ to explain the important character and nature of Dublin's historic resources and ~~to~~ assist property owners in making appropriate architectural and site modifications.

All owners of properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places, the Ohio Historic Inventory, and the Ohio Archeological Inventory are strongly encouraged to ~~utilize~~ use federal, state and local design guidelines when modifying historic structures and properties. Local protection from inappropriate alterations or demolition is possible for those properties designated in Dublin's ~~Codified Ordinances~~ Zoning Code as ~~part of~~ the Architectural Review District, making the periodic update of the Zoning Code an important aspect to the protection of historic properties in a rapidly growing municipality. ~~Property owners within the Architectural Review District must submit an application for Architectural Review Board review and approval that demonstrates appropriateness prior to making any exterior architectural or site modifications.~~

Substantial redevelopment and revitalization ~~is occurring~~ will continue to occur in Historic Dublin, and pressure from development ~~is~~ will begin to encroaching on outlying historic farmsteads. Of particular note, the Bridge Street District planning initiative has included a considerable effort to preserve the integrity of Historic Dublin and to build upon its success as a walkable, mixed use destination. Zoning regulations adopted in 2012 include special districts for the historic residential neighborhoods along South Riverview and South High Streets, as well as the historic commercial core along High and Bridge Streets. Special building types and other development requirements are designed to encourage appropriate infill development that respects the scale and character of the Historic District, and that can appropriately easily transitions to adjacent denser, more modern urban neighborhoods. Innovative development strategies such as these,

coupled with other ~~E~~local preservation efforts, ensure that the quality of Historic Dublin and the rich historic character of the Dublin area can be maintained and enhanced for future generations.

~~III.~~ OBJECTIVES AND STRATEGIES

Refer to S:\2012 Community Plan Amendment\CP Chapters\6 - Historic Preservation\ Chapter Six Objectives - Redline
Draft.docx